Exploration, Encounter, Exchange:

Témoignage and the Dilemma of Humanitarian Aid

Adam Nussbaum
Senior Individual Documentary
Process Paper: 500 words
Process Paper

Every three months, I travel to Ensenada, Mexico and volunteer in a dental clinic for children. As I interact with people from very different living situations, these trips remind me to be grateful for everything I have, and instill a desire to engage with the global community. They piqued my interest in humanitarian work, and I wanted to use History Day as an opportunity to learn more about the subject. Doctors Without Borders, known as Médecins Sans Frontières, is a publicly controversial organization. I decided MSF’s unique humanitarian approach would fit with the theme of exploration, encounter, and exchange.

I began my research by watching the documentary Living in Emergency. As this was only an introduction to the topic, I additionally read through several books from the SD Central Library. After establishing a background knowledge of MSF, I continued my research by visiting the MSF and Red Cross websites. Because humanitarian aid is such a broad topic, I encountered difficulty in narrowing my focus to MSF’s ideological exploration. After doing so, I read several articles about MSF’s approach and neutrality in complex humanitarian crises.

MSF has a research program known as the Speaking Out Case Studies. I used these reflective reports to better understand exactly how MSF has employed temoignage in each historical crisis. Each report had a linked page of reference materials. Unfortunately, most of the sources were in French, and I spent hours transcribing and translating them. Nonetheless, these collections were valuable resources, as they provided primary source documents and footage from the Rwandan Genocide, the Ethiopian Famine, and the Russian-Chechen War. Through this archive I contacted Dr. Rony Brauman, the international MSF president during the Rwandan
Genocide. I also had the opportunity to speak with Dr. James Orbinski, MSF President during the Russian-Chechen War, and Dr. Joanne Liu, the current MSF President.

A challenge I encountered during my research was understanding the negative effects of MSF’s publicity-focused approach. To ameliorate this, I pressed my interviewees to explore the downsides of témoignage. For a more balanced representation of ideas, I also spoke with Beat Schweizer, an ICRC worker and expert on political humanitarianism, and Professor Fonna Forman, a secondary perspective on MSF’s work.

Because of the abundance of powerful images and footage, as well as a clear chronology of events, I believe a documentary was the best media form with which to present this topic. After completing the majority of my research, I wrote my script, recorded, and finalized the visuals using Final Cut Pro.

Médecins Sans Frontières explored a new system of providing humanitarian aid with témoignage, or speaking out against atrocities. This exploration addressed problematic encounters with nations who manipulated humanitarian aid to fulfill political agendas. With témoignage, MSF engaged in a verbal exchange with the international community to protest this misuse of medical aid and to publicize hidden human rights abuses. This exploration of témoignage revolutionized humanitarianism through public dialogue with people and countries globally, and continues to address the complexities of humanitarian aid today.
Annotated Bibliography

Primary Sources

Interviews

Al-Tikriti, Nabil. Videoconference interview. 18 Aug. 2015.

Nabil Al-Tikriti is on the Board of Directors for MSF USA and has many years of experience working as a field administrator for the organization. He thoroughly described the benefits and drawbacks of financial independence, and provided a clear chronology of how MSF’s ideology has changed since its founding. He also compared MSF to the ICRC, highlighting the how ICRC uses governmental approval to gain secure access to warzones, while MSF often works outside of government channels. Because this was my first interview, Al-Tikriti’s extensive explanations conveyed the immense complexity of MSF’s work, and he additionally provided several resources which I pursued later. This is a primary source interview because Al-Tikriti was reflecting on his own experiences as an MSF worker.

Asgary, Ramin. Telephone interview. 7 Dec. 2015.

Ramin Asgary is on the MSF USA Board of Directors, and is a former medical clinic director and worker. During our interview, he provided first-hand insight on the difficulties of providing aid amidst a foreign culture. He was especially helpful in providing anecdotal evidence from his own experiences. These primary source stories helped me better understand the complexity of doing medical work in other countries.


Rony Brauman was the international president of MSF twice in the 1990’s, and is an experienced expert on MSF and the history of humanitarian aid. Brauman highlighted the historical examples of North Korea and Syria for the government prohibiting MSF from providing aid in their
countries. However, he strongly emphasized that only a small minority of countries force MSF to either leave the country or provide aid illegally; most governments consent to their humanitarian work. Brauman helped me better understand the rationale for MSF’s unique ideology. This is a primary source interview because Brauman is reflecting on his own experiences with the organization.


Arjan Hehenkamp is general director for MSF, and has worked in several other positions in the organization over the past 25 years. During our interview he addressed the necessity of financial independence from political powers, and discussed the pros and cons of speaking out in complex humanitarian crises. I used this interview to help me better understand why it is so vital for MSF to take action if they encounter human rights abuses in their work.


Joost Herman is a professor of Globalization studies and Humanitarian Action at the University of Groningen, and a well-known humanitarian academic. Mr. Herman outlined the necessity of clarity in the battlefield, as humanitarian workers regardless of organization are often associated with one another by foreign entities. He described how MSF prioritizes this delineation of neutrality by engaging with the people and cultures around them. Mr. Herman also helped me understand the extreme complexity of each situation, and conveyed the importance of humanitarianism in a modern world riddled with inhumanity. This is a secondary source interview because Mr. Herman was reflecting on his research of humanitarianism, and not sharing his own first-person experiences.

Liu, Joanne. Videoconference interview. 27 May 2016.

Dr. Joanne Liu is the current president of MSF, the international humanitarian organization. Not only does she have decades of experience working as a doctor in violent conflict regions, but Dr.
Liu is also a present-day authority on the humanitarian approach of témoignage. Dr. Liu employs témoignage on a daily basis and has been a constant in the recent news, calling for an end to the alarming increase in military attacks on MSF hospitals since October. This current perspective on the recent events in the Middle east as well as the utility of témoignage in the modern humanitarian sphere was extremely useful for the modern connection in my topic.

Orbinski, James. Videoconference interview. 13 May 2016.

Dr. James Orbinski is a former president of MSF, the international humanitarian organization, and received the Nobel Peace Prize on behalf of MSF in 1999. I use his famous speech, during which he criticized the Russian government for silent civilian bombings, in my documentary as a clear example of MSF employing témoignage in a volatile situation. Dr. Orbinski provided a primary source reflection on his decision to make the controversial speech, and I used this perspective in my documentary to show how he weighed the potential negative consequences of his actions against the benefits.


Dirk Salomons is a Professor of Humanitarian Policy at Columbia University and a former executive director of UN peacekeeping operations. During our interview, he outlined the role of poverty in humanitarian crises, and the multi-layered complexity of each crisis. He also clearly outlined the advantages and disadvantages of retaining complete neutrality in a politically tense environment. This is a primary source interview because Salomons is speaking about observations of the humanitarian process during his experience as an aid worker.


Beat Schweizer is an ICRC regional director, and has written several articles on the subject of humanitarianism. Mr. Schweizer provided information about the differences between the ICRC and MSF, and emphasized that both organizations have shifting ideologies that share the common
principle of neutrality. This interview was especially important for my project because it provided a new perspective from the ICRC, which allowed for a more balanced representation of ideas in my documentary. This is a primary source interview because Mr. Schweizer is reflecting on his own experiences with both the ICRC and MSF.


Sandrine Tiller is a Humanitarian Programs Advisor and Spokesperson for MSF UK. Her expertise is the use of témoignage in situations where aid has been politicized. During our interview, Ms. Tiller explained the difference between neutrality and silence, and helped me understand that a significant reason MSF employs témoignage is to highlight hidden humanitarian crises. She also conveyed the importance of media in such international exchanges, which I included in my documentary. This is a primary source interview because Ms. Tiller spoke about her current position in the organization and her own experiences with témoignage.


Ulrike von Pilar is a Humanitarian Advisor for MSF Germany, and has worked with MSF for almost twenty years. During our interview, she provided information on the cultural, political, and environmental challenges of providing aid in a foreign country. She also highlighted the importance of careful language when speaking of MSF’s ideology, as the wrong brand can possibly damage foreign relations. This is a primary source because Ms. Pilar spoke from her first-hand experience as a humanitarian worker.

Periodicals

“Appel Rwanda” [“Appeal of Rwanda”]. *Le Monde* 18 June 1994: n. pag. *MSF Speaking Out*. Web. 19 Apr. 2016. This is MSF’s publication in the French Le Monde Newspaper criticizing the international community for political inaction during the Rwandan Genocide. I used this in my
documentary as a clear example of témoignage. The quote (in english), “You can’t stop a genocide with doctors!” was especially useful, as it concisely describes the necessity of témoignage in response to the misuse of humanitarian aid.

Brauman, Rony. “Médecins Sans Frontières and the ICRC: Matters of Principle.” International Review of the Red Cross 94 (2012): n. pag. Web. 16 Feb. 2016. This is an article written by one of my interviewees, Rony Brauman. Although he contrasted the ICRC and MSF, Brauman also emphasized the great similarities between them. The article also helped me better understand how the ICRC is more structured and unified, while MSF is slightly disjointed because of the lack of international law defining its role as an organization. This is a primary source because Brauman is reflecting on his own experiences with both organizations.


“Doctors Without Borders Awarded Nobel Peace Prize.” Lawrence Journal-World 16 Oct. 1999: n. pag. Google News. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a newspaper published in 1999 announcing MSF’s receipt of the Nobel Peace Prize. I used this image in an overlapping effect with several other newspapers with similar headlines, to demonstrate the global publicity that MSF received as a result of the award, and how they used it to publicize the unjust bombings by the Russian government in Chechnya.

similar headlines, to demonstrate the global publicity that MSF received as a result of the award, and how they used it to publicize the unjust bombings by the Russian government in Chechnya.

“Doctors Without Borders Withdraws Personnel.” Gainesville Sun 1 Oct. 1998: n. pag. Google News. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a newspaper article about MSF being expelled from North Korea in 1998. I used this image in my documentary when I described the negative effects of speaking out against a government while simultaneously providing aid in that country.

Kouchner, Bernard. “The Changing Role of Humanitarianism: A Study Guide to the Work of Bernard Kouchner.” Morgenthau Lectures (2004): n. pag. Carnegie Council. Web. 10 Aug. 2015. This is a lecture by Bernard Kouchner, a founder of MSF and long-time humanitarian worker. Kouchner thoroughly describes the pros and cons of completely neutral humanitarianism vs. media-centered humanitarianism (using temoignage). As I listened to this lecture early in my research process, it provided an overview of general humanitarian complexities which prepared me to later learn about MSF’s ideology. This is a primary source because Bernard Kouchner is reflecting on his own experiences in the field of humanitarianism.

Mellgren, Doug. “Doctors Without Borders Accepts Nobel Peace Prize.” Moscow-Pullman Daily News 10 Dec. 1999: n. pag. Google News. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a newspaper published in 1999 announcing MSF’s receipt of the Nobel Peace Prize. I used this image in an overlapping effect with several other newspapers with similar headlines, to demonstrate the global publicity that MSF received as a result of the award, and how they used it to publicize the unjust bombings by the Russian government in Chechnya.

“Nobel Peace Prize Awarded to Medecins Sans Frontieres.” The Nation’s Health 29.10 (1999): 15. ProQuest. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a newspaper published in 1999 announcing MSF’s receipt of the Nobel Peace Prize. I used this image in my documentary when I mentioned this event, to
demonstrate the global publicity that MSF used to publicize the unjust bombings by the Russian government in Chechnya.

Rubin, Julia. “Civilians Die in ‘Shadow War.’” *Ocala Star-Banner* 19 Dec. 1996: n. pag. Google News. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a newspaper article about civilian victims of the civil war between Russia and Chechnya. I used this image in my documentary to demonstrate the extreme obscurity surrounding the ‘shadow war’ in Chechnya, and how that justified MSF publicly denouncing the Russian government.

“Russian Journalist Who Exposed Chechnya Abuses Is Shot to Death.” *Toledo Blade* 8 Oct. 2006: n. pag. Google News. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a newspaper article about the a journalist killed in Chechnya during the Russian Civil War. I used this image in my documentary as an example of how the Russian government hid the events in Chechnya from the press. This was the justification for MSF speaking out during the war.


“Slaughter at Hospital in Rwanda: Gunmen Slay 170 in Unremitting Chaos.” *Newsday* [New York] 25 Apr. 1994: n. pag. *MSF Speaking Out*. Web. 5 May 2016. This is an American Newspaper article about the Rwandan Genocide. The descriptions of human carnage demonstrate a sharp contrast between the international understanding of the crisis and simultaneous international inaction. In the article Dr. Zacharias, MSF president at the time of the conflict, conveyed his desire for the international community to take action to prevent further loss of life. This primary source helped
me understand the global visibility of the crisis, and further provided insight as to why MSF decided to employ témoignage.

*Time* 16 May 1994. *Time.* Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a Time magazine cover from the time period of the Rwandan Genocide. I used this image in my documentary when I described the international visibility of the crisis, and explained how this resulted in MSF focusing more on a verbal exchange with international powers that with the public.


**Nonperiodicals**

Biberson, Philippe. *Chechnya Petition.* Paris: MSF, 1999. *MSF Speaking Out.* Web. 5 May 2016. This is a petition written by Dr. Philippe Biberson, 1999 MSF President, about the Russian-Chechen Civil War. Dr. Biberson asks the reader to support MSF in demanding that the Russian government immediately “halt the indiscriminate bombing of the Chechen population.” This primary source petition is another example of MSF using various forms of communication to spread their message of témoignage during the Chechen crisis.

Bolton, Samantha, comp. *MSF: ‘Chechnya: The Politics of Terror’ Report.* N.p.: MSF, 2000. *Speaking Out Case Studies.* Web. 5 May 2016. This is a press coverage review of another MSF report about the Russian-Chechen civil war published earlier. The review analyzes in detail the international reception of MSF’s press report. The extensive descriptions of each country’s media coverage helped me understand the importance of global publicity to MSF.
The Chechen Republic: Far from Peace. N.p.: MSF, 1996. MSF Speaking. Web. 20 Apr. 2016. This is an extensive MSF issue brief on the Russian-Chechen Civil War. The document includes an overview of the Chechen conflict, as well as specific examples of numerous civilian attacks by Russian federal forces. It also lists MSF’s demands for the international response. This detailed primary source helped me better understand the Chechen conflict, which allowed me to fully comprehend MSF’s decision to employ témoignage in Chechnya.

Conférence de Presse de Médecins Sans Frontières: Rwanda. MSF Speaking Out. MSF, 17 June 1994. Web. 5 May 2016. This is a dossier passed out at an MSF press conference about the Rwandan genocide. While it contains information about the crisis in Rwanda, the most important part is the front page, on which is printed the words: “N’arrête pas un génocide avec des médecins!” (You can’t stop a genocide with doctors). As I explain in my documentary, this phrase represents MSF’s témoignage in Rwanda. The presence of this phrase on several public documents, including this dossier, demonstrates how MSF used as many methods of communication as possible to spread their message.

Fingerprints of International Aid on Forced Relocation, Repression, and Human Rights Abuse in Ethiopia. ECADF: Ethiopian News & Views. ECADF, 17 July 2013. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This press release includes a photograph of Ethiopian federal soldiers monitoring a group of relocated rebels. I used this image in my documentary when I described how the Ethiopian government redirected humanitarian funds to change the human geography of the country through aggressive villagization programs.

The Genocide. MSF Speaking Out. MSF, June 1994. Web. 5 May 2016. This is a leaflet about the Rwandan Genocide sent by MSF to its donors. In the leaflet MSF defines the conflict in Rwanda as genocide, then includes the famous phrase: “On n’arrête pas un génocide avec des médecins!”
(You can’t stop a genocide with doctors). This primary source is another example of MSF using various forms of communication to employ témoignage during the Rwandan crisis.

Médecins Sans Frontièr. *Les Civils Cibles Des Combats [Civilians Targeted in the Fighting].* MSF *Speaking Out.* MSF, 30 Mar. 1995. Web. 19 Apr. 2016. This is an MSF Chechen press release about the Russian-Chechen Civil War. In the document, MSF describes the various attacks conducted by Russian forces on both Chechen civilians and humanitarian aid groups. MSF further publicly condemns these actions, and demands a “firm and immediate” response on behalf of the international community to the Russian war crimes. This source was a clear example of MSF employing témoignage to publicly denounce an oppressive government.

---. *MSF Calls for Increased UN Presence in Violence-stricken Rwanda.* MSF *Speaking Out.* MSF, 28 Apr. 1994. Web. 19 Apr. 2016. This is a press release from MSF about the international response to the Rwandan Genocide. In the document, MSF representative Dr. Rony Zacharias directly criticized the United Nations for failing to intervene militarily. This primary source helped me understand how MSF executed témoignage through frequent press releases that targeted certain international bodies during the Rwandan Genocide.

Médecins Sans Frontièr. *Communiqué de Presse. MSF Speaking Out.* MSF, Nov. 2000. Web. 5 May 2016. This is a press release by MSF about the Russian-Chechen civil war. MSF publicly denounces the Russian government for committing abhorrent war crimes against Chechen civilians. They also highlight the government’s false “normalization” of the conflict. This source demonstrates MSF using news media to employ témoignage during the Chechnya War.

Médecins Sans Frontièr USA. *Humanitarian Group Says “It’s a Matter of Hours for the Survivors of Genocide in Rwanda.” Appeal for Immediate Intervention Made on Capitol Hill and at the United Nations.* MSF *Speaking Out.* MSF, 16 June 1994. Web. 5 May 2016. This is a press release from the USA branch of MSF about the Rwandan Genocide. The press release provides contact
information for Dr. Jean Hervé Bradol, an 1994 MSF representative, and encourages American journalists to contact him about the Rwandan crisis. This primary source shows the importance of international publicity in MSF’s work, specifically during the Rwandan Genocide.

“Rule 35: Hospital and Safety Zones and Neutralized Zones.” *Customary International Humanitarian Law*. International Committee of the Red Cross, 2015. Web. 30 Dec. 2015. This is a law from a Red Cross database of international humanitarian laws. It states that it is illegal to attack a civilian hospital in a war-zone. This is relevant because of the recent bombing of an MSF war hospital in Afghanistan by the United States military. This source helped me understand the legal support for MSF’s request that the U.S. be reprimanded.

*Russia Must Stop Indiscriminate Attacks against Civilians in Chechnya - the People of Chechnya Must Be Given Access to Humanitarian Aid. MSF Speaking Out*. MSF, 2016. Web. 19 Apr. 2016. This is an MSF press release from December 10, 1999, the same day as Dr. James Orbinski’s Nobel Peace Prize acceptance speech. This document outlines the ideas Dr. Orbinski will cover in his speech, and reiterates MSF’s bold statement of témoignage against the Russian Government. This is another clear example of MSF making every effort to employ témoignage through all media forms.

United Nations Security Council (SC), Resolution 909. 5 Apr. 1994. This is a UNSC Resolution about the Rwandan Genocide. Published during the conflict, this and other related resolutions are primary source examples of international inaction. In resolutions 909, 912, 918, 925, and 965, the UNSC makes the same statement: that the international community should continue providing humanitarian aid to victims in Rwanda. The presence of this statement in each resolution provided a concrete example of how the United Nations (as well as foreign governments) used humanitarian aid as a substitute for necessary political action.
United Nations Security Council (SC), Resolution 912. 21 Apr. 1994. This is a UNSC Resolution about the Rwandan Genocide. Published during the conflict, this and other related resolutions are primary source examples of international inaction. In resolutions 909, 912, 918, 925, and 965, the UNSC makes the same statement: that the international community should continue providing humanitarian aid to victims in Rwanda. The presence of this statement in each resolution provided a concrete example of how the United Nations (as well as foreign governments) used humanitarian aid as a substitute for necessary political action.

United Nations Security Council (SC), Resolution 918. 17 May. 1994. This is a UNSC Resolution about the Rwandan Genocide. Published during the conflict, this and other related resolutions are primary source examples of international inaction. In resolutions 909, 912, 918, 925, and 965, the UNSC makes the same statement: that the international community should continue providing humanitarian aid to victims in Rwanda. The presence of this statement in each resolution provided a concrete example of how the United Nations (as well as foreign governments) used humanitarian aid as a substitute for necessary political action.

United Nations Security Council (SC), Resolution 925. 8 June. 1994. This is a UNSC Resolution about the Rwandan Genocide. Published during the conflict, this and other related resolutions are primary source examples of international inaction. In resolutions 909, 912, 918, 925, and 965, the UNSC makes the same statement: that the international community should continue providing humanitarian aid to victims in Rwanda. The presence of this statement in each resolution provided a concrete example of how the United Nations (as well as foreign governments) used humanitarian aid as a substitute for necessary political action.

United Nations Security Council (SC), Resolution 965. 30 Nov. 1994. This is a UNSC Resolution about the Rwandan Genocide. Published during the conflict, this and other related resolutions are primary source examples of international inaction. In resolutions 909, 912, 918, 925, and 965, the
UNSC makes the same statement: that the international community should continue providing humanitarian aid to victims in Rwanda. The presence of this statement in each resolution provided a concrete example of how the United Nations (as well as foreign governments) used humanitarian aid as a substitute for necessary political action.

Audiovisual

Bradol, Jean-Hervé. *MSF: From Actions to Words. YouTube.* YouTube, 30 May 2013. Web. 19 Apr. 2016. This is a video about MSF’s history, beginning with their split from the Red Cross in 1971 during the Biafra War. The section about the Rwandan Genocide included an interview with Dr. Bradol, MSF International President from 2000 to 2008. I used a clip from this interview in my documentary to support the idea that humanitarian aid was completely useless in the context of genocide.

*Greetings from Grozny: Inside the Chechen Conflict. Classroom Video On Demand.* Films Media Group, 2002. Web. 13 June 2016. This is a video clip about the Chechnya-Russia Civil War of the 1990’s. I used footage of the war from this video to demonstrate the general violence and terror present in the region during the time period, as well as the specific targeting of civilians by the Russian government.

“Jason Cone at MSF Press Conf.” *ABC News.* ABC News Network, 2016. Web. 16 Feb. 2016. This is a photograph of Jason Cone, Executive Director of MSF USA, speaking about the October bombings by the U.S. military on an MSF hospital in Afghanistan. Although this is not an example of MSF’s traditional temoignage, it represents the willingness of MSF to speak out against international powers and defend victims of injustice. I used this image in my documentary when I introduced MSF’s encounter of governments perpetuating the humanitarian dilemma.
Joanne Liu at MSF Press Conf. *The Washington Times.* Washington Times, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a photograph of Joanne Liu, the current president of MSF, and two other representatives at a press conference in Geneva, Switzerland. They are calling for U.S. leadership to approve an independent investigation into the deadly U.S. bombing of an MSF hospital in Afghanistan last October. I used this image in my documentary when I described a potential downside to MSF’s testimony is the extreme subjectivity to the current leadership (i.e. Joanne Liu).

*Living in Emergency: Stories of Doctors Without Borders.* Dir. Mark Hopkins. Prod. Naisola Grimwod and Daniel Holton-Ruth. Red Floor Pictures, 2008. Film. I watched this documentary during the early stages of my research. It provided an intimate look at the harsh conditions in which many MSF volunteers work. It also clearly highlighted several drawbacks to MSF’s less structured, independent style: a lack of resources and staff can leave doctors stranded in overwhelming conditions. The documentary additionally filmed much of the local culture and general quality of life, which further helped me understand the difficulty of introducing Western medicine into such places. This source contained many primary source interviews and testimonies, as well as striking footage of human suffering during conflict.

Mclean, Duncan. “Somalia: Providing Humanitarian Aid on al-Shabab’s Turf.” Interview by Marco Werman. *The World.* Hosted by Marco Werman. PRI. 15 Feb. 2012. Radio. This is an interview with Duncan Mclean, an MSF volunteer who managed the humanitarian program in Somalia as well as programs in other foreign nations. He describes the criticism MSF has received for treating both wounded African union soldiers and the opposition Islamic fighters. Mclean additionally explains the need for leniency on the opposition force’s actions, although they may be disagreeable, so MSF may continue to provide aid without conflict in certain fragile regions. This source helped further my understanding of MSF’s neutrality policies. It is a primary source
interview because Mclean was present for and involved in MSF’s humanitarian aid efforts in Somalia.

MSF Humanitarian Workers. *Medecins Sans Frontieres*. MSF, 2016. Web. 16 Feb. 2016. This is MSF’s international website. The website provided all of the general photographs of MSF workers providing aid in foreign countries. I used these images in various parts of my documentary to demonstrate the underlying purpose of MSF: to provide assistance to those in need. Because I focus largely on testimonial, these images serve as reminders that MSF is first and foremost a humanitarian organization.

*Nigeria vs. Biafra: Biafra Civil War Documentary*. YouTube. YouTube, 2 Jan. 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is primary source footage from the Nigerian Civil War, also known as the Biafran War. I used footage of soldiers in my documentary when I introduced the Biafran War, and used additional clips of Biafran civilians to show the the hardships they endured as a result of the oppressive Nigerian government.

Russian Soldier Killed by Chechen Fighters. *Gazettenet*. Daily Hampshire Gazette, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is an photograph of a Russian federal soldier lying dead next to a group of Chechen soldiers and an army tank outside of the presidential palace in Grozny, Russia. I used this image in my documentary when I described the extreme casualties caused by a global increase in civil wars.


*Rwanda: The World Reacts. History*. History.com, 2016. Web. 13 June 2016. This is a video from History.com about the atrocities of the Rwandan Genocide. I used the powerful primary source
footage from this video clip in my documentary when I described the international response to the Rwandan crisis.

*Speaking Out Case Studies. MSF Speaking Out.* Médecins Sans Frontières, n.d. Web. 31 Mar. 2016. This is an MSF video about their Speaking Out Case Studies program. It includes an interview with Philippe Biberson, an MSF representative, on the necessity of military intervention during the Rwandan Genocide. This quote further supported my ideas about the Rwandan Genocide.

Williams College. *Fiona Terry on Dilemmas in Human Intervention. YouTube.* YouTube, 18 Oct. 2011. Web. 26 Dec. 2015. This is a lecture MSF field worker and author Fiona Terry gave at Williams College about the dilemmas of providing humanitarian aid in foreign countries. She explained the necessity of delineating a separation between true humanitarian aid and conditional relief with a political agenda. This source additionally helped me understand how the use of relief as a military strategy can be harmful to the inhabitants of areas of conflict and other aid organizations in those areas. It is a primary source because Fiona Terry was present for and involved in the events which she described.

**Web sites, e-sources**

“About MSF.” *Medecins Sans Frontieres.* MSF, 2016. Web. 9 Feb. 2016. This page from MSF’s website provided a brief description of MSF’s purpose and principles. I used this source in my early research, and I was able to compare it to the parallel descriptions from other organizations such as Medecins du Monde and the Red Cross. It was also useful to see how MSF presented its own values in a palatable form for outside observers, and how that differed from more in-depth articles on their complete principles.

Jason Cone, the Executive Director of MSF U.S.A., about the recent military attack on a humanitarian hospital located in northern Afghanistan. Cone asked for the U.S. to participate in an in-depth investigation by the International Fact-Finding Commission into the shooting that killed 23 civilians and MSF staff. This story provided a modern-day example of the ever-present danger that MSF doctors face daily in their humanitarian missions. This is a primary source because Mr. Cone is expressing his own opinions about a current event.

“Dr. Bernard Kouchner and MSF: A Clarification.” Medecins Sans Frontieres. MSF, 2015. Web. 10 Aug. 2015. This web page describes the relationship between Bernard Kouchner and MSF. It clarifies that MSF’s mission is separate from that of the French government and Bernard Kouchner, and outlines the importance of political neutrality when providing international humanitarian aid in a general crisis. This helped me understand how important it is for MSF to uphold a certain image of neutrality, and how although they do sometimes sacrifice that neutrality in extreme crises, they are primarily a medical humanitarian organization.

“Founding of MSF.” Doctors Without Borders. MSF, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a page from the MSF USA website (MSF USA is commonly known as Doctors Without Borders). It describes the entire chronology of MSF’s founding, and includes a video about MSF’s entire history, including informative interviews and primary source footage I used in my documentary. The page also contained an image of MSF’s original founders seated around a conference table, which I used during my introduction.

“Gallery: You Can’t Stop Genocide with Doctors.” Medecins Sans Frontieres. MSF, 28 Apr. 2014. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a photo gallery of MSF providing humanitarian aid in Rwanda. I used these powerful images when I introduce the Rwandan Genocide in my documentary.

Gluck, Kenneth. “Paris Advocacy Event.” 22 Oct. 2000. E-mail. This is an email between MSF workers about the Chechnyan crisis. The email includes a detailed plan of action for MSF’s speaking out
against the Russian Government, and most significantly includes a large section on the risks involved with speaking out. This source helped me understand the complexities of témoignage, as with every outward public action, MSF further endangers their workers in conflict zones.

“Independent, Neutral, Impartial.” Medecins Sans Frontieres: United Kingdom. MSF, 2015. Web. 30 Dec. 2015. This is an article from the British branch of MSF about the organizations’ three core values: Independence, Neutrality, and Impartiality. The source includes the definition of each word and succinctly describes the practical application of all three in MSF’s humanitarian missions. This helped me better understand the basic ideas behind the often controversial actions of the organization. This is a primary source because it was written by MSF workers and represents the current opinion of the organization.

“MSF Charter and Principles.” Medecins Sans Frontieres. MSF, 2015. Web. 10 Aug. 2015. This is MSF’s charter and founding principles, publicly available on their international website. The page outlines the many aspects of MSF’s ideology, including the prioritized importance of medical care, as well as the principles of neutrality, impartiality, and independence. In addition to providing clear primary source information about MSF’s ideas, the charter also helped me understand that there is a difference between silence and neutrality, and MSF will speak out only in situation when they feel it is the only moral option.

“Speaking Out: Advocacy and Témoignage.” Doctors Without Borders. MSF, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is a page from the MSF USA website (MSF USA is commonly known as Doctors Without Borders). It provided a chronology of the crises during which MSF publicly spoke out. This helped me understand through historical examples how and why MSF employs témoignage. The page also included three photographs of an MSF humanitarian worker, of several MSF representatives at a press conference in Yemen, and of forced relocation camps in Ethiopia. I used all three of these primary source images in my documentary.
“Speaking Out Case Studies.” *MSF Speaking Out*. MSF, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is an MSF website that holds all of their research reports. These public reports, known as Speaking Out Case Studies, reflect on MSF’s use of témoignage in each crisis, and additionally provide a chronology of events. Although I also used this website to access the case studies for research, I specifically used two photographs from the home page. I used the first photograph of a young Rony Brauman, whom I interviewed, speaking out at a press conference about the Ethiopian forced relocations in 1985, and the second photograph of MSF protestors in Grozny, Chechnya during the Russian-Chechen Civil War in my documentary as examples of témoignage.

“Videos.” *MSF Speaking Out*. MSF, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is the video reference page for the MSF Chechnya Case Study. The first video provided footage of soldiers in the Russian-Chechen Civil War. The seventh video includes two speeches by James Orbinski (former MSF president): the first at an improvised press conference immediately following the announcement of MSF as the Nobel Peace Prize awardee, and the second at a later speech in Oslo, Norway during which Orbinski publicly implored the Russian President to cease the bombing of Chechen civilians. I used the first speech in my documentary for both the introduction and conclusion, and the second speech to show how MSF will use international publicity to place responsibility on abusive governments.

“Videos.” *MSF Speaking Out*. MSF, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is the video reference page for the MSF Ethiopia Case Study. I used footage of starving Ethiopians from video #1 in my documentary when I introduced the Ethiopian Famine.

“Videos.” *MSF Speaking Out*. MSF, 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is the video reference page for the MSF Rwanda Case Study. From videos #3 and #8, I used footage of members of the hutu militia wielding machetes, as well as startling video of the piles of massacred Tutsis.
Unpublished & other sources

Biberson, Philippe. Letter to Philippe Seguin. 15 June 1994. Genocide of Rwandan Tutsi: Reference Materials. *MSF Speaking Out.* Web. 5 May 2016. This is a letter from the 1994 President of MSF France to the President of the French National Assembly about the Rwandan Genocide. In the letter, MSF President Dr. Philippe Biberson openly criticizes the international community for its “hopeless inertia” in response to the Rwandan crisis, and asks for President Seguin’s support in MSF’s “public appeal” (to be publicly released just two days later during an MSF press conference). This primary source is a clear example of MSF reaching out to international authorities through témoignage.

- - -. “Lettre Ouverte de Médecins Sans Frontières à l’Ensemble des Présidents et Premiers Ministres des pays Membres de l’OSCE.” Letter. 17 Nov. 1999. War Crimes and Politics of Terror in Chechnya: Reference Materials. *MSF Speaking Out.* Web. 5 May 2016. This is an open letter from 1999 MSF President Philippe Biberson to the presidents and prime ministers of the OSCE member states. Dr. Biberson bluntly condemned the Russian war tactics against civilians, and implored the European authorities to collectively “pressure” the Russian government to halt the civilian bombings. This source was significant because it revealed the motive behind MSF’s témoignage campaigns: to publicly place international pressure on certain governments. I included this idea in my documentary.

Bolton, Samantha. “Chechnya Campaign Report.” Memo. 25 Apr. 1996. TS. War Crimes and Politics of Terror in Chechnya: Reference Materials. This is an MSF memo about recent press coverage of the Russian-Chechen civil war. The message included feedback from different international correspondents, as well as a summary of MSF’s press coverage in each country. This primary source demonstrated MSF’s commitment to témoignage, and helped me understand the meticulous detail with which MSF publicity campaigns are carried out.
Web. 13 June 2016. This primary source document clearly states the International Red Cross’ founding ideology. I used their ideas about strict neutrality as supporting evidence in my documentary to show an alternate humanitarian approach, very different from MSF’s témoignage.
Zachariah, Rony. “Presentation of Médecins Sans Frontières to the UN Commission on Human Rights - Rwanda.” UN Commission on Human Rights. Geneva. 24 May 1994. MSF Speaking Out. MSF, 24 May 1994. Web. 19 Apr. 2016. This are notes prepared by Dr. Zachariah, General Coordinator, for a presentation to the UN Commission on Human Rights. The paper includes three first-person descriptions of incidents of inhumane atrocities committed by the Rwandan Hutu militia against both Tutsi civilians and MSF medical workers. At the end of the document, there are four questions for the UNCHR listed. These questions demonstrate MSF’s concern for civilian life in extreme conflict, and their frustration with the inability of humanitarian aid to ameliorate political strife.
Secondary Sources

Interviews

Forman, Fonna. Personal interview. 6 June 2016.

Fonna Forman is a professor of Political Science and the founder of a cross-border humanitarian initiative at the University of California San Diego. As an expert on the dilemmas of providing humanitarian aid in a political context, Professor Forman was able to provide a secondary perspective on a wide range of historical humanitarian dilemmas, including the most efficient provision of humanitarian aid and the dangers of remaining silent contrasted with the dangers of speaking out. In my documentary, I specifically used her ideas about the lack of intervention during the Rwandan Genocide, as she defended the international community’s decision to not intervene, recognizing the extreme dangers of such drastic armed intervention. This provided a valuable opposing perspective in my documentary, and allowed for representation of those foreign nations present during the Rwandan conflict.


Susannah Friedman is the Emergency Conflict Response Manager for CARE International, a well-established humanitarian organization. She provided a secondary perspective on MSF’s humanitarian methods, and described how MSF works with other humanitarian groups in the field when they do decide to speak out.

Periodicals

“Humanitarian NGOs: Challenges and Trends.” HPG Policy Briefs 12: n. pag. Web. 29 Dec. 2015. This is a policy briefing paper published by an international humanitarian institute. The papers describe three informal classifications of humanitarian groups: religious, Wilsonian, and Dunantist. Religious NGOs are driven by a specific faith, Wilsonian NGOs are more diplomatic and often
incorporate certain political agendas in their missions, and Dunantist are primarily humanitarian, completely apolitical, and mostly independent. Although MSF is decisively Dunantist, this source informed me of the alternate humanitarian ideologies, which helped me better understand MSF’s motivation behind their mission and how they are unique in the humanitarian sphere.

*Le Monde* [Montreal] 9 Jan. 1888. *Google News*. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. This is an 1888 publication of the Le Monde newspaper. MSF published an ad in this newspaper in 1994 to call for military action in Rwanda. As the original document is not so visually appealing, I used the front page of the old Le Monde newspaper in my documentary as a faded backdrop for MSF’s French document.

**Nonperiodicals**

Binet, Laurence. *Famine and Forced Relocations in Ethiopia 1984-1986. MSF Speaking Out*. MSF, n.d. Web. 27 Mar. 2016. This is an extensive MSF research report about the Rwandan Genocide that is part of a larger collection of “case studies.” This collection of public reports, known as Speaking Out Case Studies, reflect on MSF’s use of temoignage in specific historical crises. As these reports are all created by an experienced MSF research team over a long period of time, the information is detailed and reliable. Although it is a secondary source, this report on the Ethiopian Famine contains several primary source quotes, interviews, and statistics. A specific quote I used in my documentary from this source is (on the illegal redirection of aid funds to a brutal military relocation program), “Aid is not being used to save people, but to oppress them.”

---. *Genocide of Rwandan Tutsi 1994. MSF Speaking Out*. MSF, n.d. Web. 27 Mar. 2016. This is an extensive MSF research report about the Rwandan Genocide that is part of a larger collection of “case studies.” This collection of public reports, known as Speaking Out Case Studies, reflect on MSF’s use of temoignage in specific historical crises. As these reports are all created by an experienced MSF research team over a long period of time, the information is detailed and
reliable. Although this is a secondary source, the report contains several primary source quotes, interviews, and statistics. I used both reflective opinion and factual information about the humanitarian response to the Rwandan Genocide from this case study to support my understanding of the situation. Additionally, the report provided a reliable chronology of events, which helped me understand the events leading up to and following MSF’s témoignage.

- - -. War Crimes and Politics of Terror in Chechnya 1994-2004. MSF Speaking Out. MSF, n.d. Web. 27 Mar. 2016. This is an extensive MSF research report about the Rwandan Genocide that is part of a larger collection of “case studies.” This collection of public reports, known as Speaking Out Case Studies, reflect on MSF’s use of témoignage in specific historical crises. As these reports are all created by an experienced MSF research team over a long period of time, the information is detailed and reliable. Although it is a secondary source, this report on the Russian-Chechen Civil War contains several primary source quotes, interviews, and statistics. I used this information, as well as the provided timeline of events to better understand the context for MSF decision to employ témoignage.


Eriksson, John. The International Response to Conflict and Genocide: Lessons from the Rwanda Experience. Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. OECD, Mar. 1996. Web. 11 Feb. 2016. Known as JEAR (Joint Evaluation of Emergency Assistance to Rwanda), this report is a synthesis of four studies examining the international response to the Rwandan Genocide. It provided information about the amount of money donated by foreign powers to the medical relief effort. The report also reaffirmed the idea that political and military action was
necessary to end the genocide and alleviate human suffering, and criticized the international community from an objective third-party perspective for using humanitarian aid as a substitute for military intervention. It is a secondary source because although it includes primary source statistics from the time period of the Rwandan Genocide, it a report of compiled research and (albeit especially authoritative) opinion.

Horvitz, Leslie Alan, and Christopher Catherwood. “Doctors Without Borders (Medecins Sans Frontieres [MSF]).” Encyclopedia of War Crimes and Genocide. New York: Infobase, 2006. Google Books. Web. 23 Mar. 2016. This is an encyclopedia of all things related to genocide and war crimes. The authors included a general description of MSF as an organization, which outlined the organization’s dual mission: to provide medical care and to advocate on behalf of victims. I used this information to better understand the humanitarian justification for employing témoignage with certain governments.


Teijgeler, René. “Archaeologist under Pressure: Neutral or Cooperative in Wartime.” Cultural Heritage, Ethics, and the Military. Ed. Peter G. Stone. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2011. N. pag. Print. This is a chapter about the humanitarian dilemma of choosing between remaining neutral to continue providing aid or speaking out and risk losing access to victims in need of care. Teijgeler’s conclusions mirrored my own, and further supported the relevance of the humanitarian dilemma in modern society.
Audiovisual

*Blood Diamond (Original Motion Picture Soundtrack).* Composed by James Newton Howard. Warner Bros Entertainment, 2006. MP3 file. The tracks in this album are both sorrowful and suspenseful, and serve to reflect the sober reality of the crises MSF is involved in. I used these songs as background music for almost all of my documentary.


*Humanitarianism in Crisis.* YouTube. YouTube, 14 Feb. 2012. Web. 3 Jan. 2016. This is a video uploaded by the Stanford Medicine program about the shifting ideology of humanitarianism. The speaker begins with the Biafra War and MSF’s founding, then continues through history, describing humanitarian responses to the crises in Ethiopia, Bosnia, Somalia, and other countries. This source helped me better understand the timeline of humanitarianism, and provided specific historical examples to demonstrate how the ideology has changed drastically over time.

“U.S. Dropping Bombs and Food Packages in Afghanistan.” *Political Cartoons by Ken Sprague.* N.p., 2002. Web. 16 Feb. 2016. This is a political cartoon depicting an Afghan man with a U.S. food package making a sardonic comment about the necessity of food aid when he is under the threat of death by violence. Although the cartoon is not about MSF, it still illustrated the problem with providing humanitarian aid in a situation that requires political action. I used this image in my conclusion when I described MSF’s encounter of governments incorrectly employing aid to fulfill political agendas.

“Variations for Piano and Orchestra.” *Syrian Symphony.* Composed by Malek Jandali. Malek Jandali, 2014. MP3. This is a song composed by Malek Jandali, a renowned composer and human rights
activist. Jandali won the GUSI peace prize in 2013 and the Global Music Humanitarian Award in 2014 for his album Syrian Symphony, which globally publicized the plight of the oppressed Syrian people. I used this calm song as background music in my documentary when I described the Red Cross’ established humanitarian principles and practices.

**Web sites, e-sources**

“Advocacy and Temoignage.” *Medecins Sans Frontieres: United Kingdom.* MSF, 2015. Web. 30 Dec. 2015. This is an article from the British branch of MSF about temoignage, or advocacy. It describes how the Red Cross used a method known as “silent diplomacy” during the Biafran War, and why several doctors from the organization rejected the Red Cross’ public silence about the atrocities the Nigerian government was committing against rebel civilians. As the idea of speaking out while still remaining neutral in a conflict is a core ideology of MSF, this source helped me better understand the nature of MSF’s founding, and the motivation behind temoignage. Although this is a secondary source because it was written after the events which it describes, it contains primary source information about MSF’s ideology and stance on advocacy. It also contains several primary source photos that I used in my documentary.

Axelrod, Alan, and Charles L. Phillips. “Nigerian-Biafran War.” *Encyclopedia of Wars, Vol. 2.* Facts On File, 2004. *Modern World History Online.* Web. 30 Dec. 2015. This is a database article about the Biafran War, also known as the Nigerian Civil War. The author describes in detail the nature of the war, tactics used by both sides (Nigeria and the rebel country Biafra), and the resulting losses. As it was after this war that several Red Cross doctors and medical journalists decided to found MSF, I used the information of what transpired to better understand why MSF’s founders felt there was a necessity for témoignage.
Borton, John. “Twenty Years On: The Rwandan Genocide and the Evaluation of the Humanitarian Response.” *Humanitarian Practice Network*. Overseas Development Institute, 4 Apr. 2014. Web. 15 Feb. 2016. The Humanitarian Practice Network is a unique forum through which anyone involved in humanitarianism can discuss modern issues and share experiences. This article described the inadequate political response to the Rwandan Genocide, and provided a link to a 4-part reflection report by objective third-parties on the entire Rwandan crisis. The information from the article and from the linked report, known as JEEAR (Joint Evaluation of Emergency Assistance to Rwanda) helped me better understand why humanitarian aid in such a political situation was almost completely ineffective.

Herman, Joost, and Dennis Dijkzeul. “A Matter of Principles: Humanitarian Challenges.” *The Broker*. Csorba Media, 2015. Web. 29 Dec. 2015. This is an article about the challenges of humanitarian aid that arises from applying Dunantist methods (Henry Dunant founded the International Red Cross). I used this source specifically to understand the 4 aspects of Dunantist humanitarianism, as these are the values which MSF is mostly based upon: humanity, neutrality, impartiality, and independence.

“Histoire et Valeurs” [“History and Values”]. *Médecins du Monde*. MdM, 2015. Web. 10 Aug. 2015. This web page concisely describes the general ideology of Medecins du Monde, an organization formed by Bernard Kouchner after MSF’s founding. I used this source early in my research, and compared the values of MdM with those of MSF. This contrast helped me understand the subtle differences between MSF and other organizations. As MdM branched from MSF for a specific reason, the differences between MdM’s ideals and those of MSF serve as guides for the possible faults of MSF’s ideology.

“History.” *The International Committee of the Red Cross*. ICRC, 2016. Web. 9 Feb. 2016. This is a timeline of the International Red Cross’ history, from its founding at the first Geneva Convention
to the present day humanitarian missions. This timeline was useful in showing the extent of the ICRC’s experience in humanitarian work. It also clarified how the Geneva Conventions relate to the ICRC. The ICRC website additionally provided several images of humanitarian workers that I used in my documentary.

“MSF History.” Médecins Sans Frontières. MSF, 2015. Web. 10 Aug. 2015. This is a short history of MSF, from its founding in 1971 to the reception of a Nobel Peace Prize in 1999. Found on the MSF official international website, I compared this timeline to that of the International Red Cross. This source provided a general base knowledge from which I was able to conduct further, more detailed research.